

The Bulletin of Zoological Nomenclature

*[ICZN] The Official Periodical
of the International Commission
on Zoological Nomenclature*

Volume 59, 2002

Published on behalf of the Commission by
The International Trust for Zoological Nomenclature
c/o The Natural History Museum
Cromwell Road
London, SW7 5BD, U.K.

ISSN 0007-5167

© International Trust for Zoological Nomenclature

Case 3210

***Catocala alabamae* Grote, 1875 (Insecta, Lepidoptera): proposed conservation of the specific name**

Lawrence F. Gall

Entomology Division, Peabody Museum of Natural History, Yale University,
New Haven, Connecticut 06520, U.S.A. (e-mail: lawrence.gall@yale.edu)

Abstract. The purpose of this application is to conserve the specific name of *Catocala alabamae* Grote, 1875 for a small, yellow-hindwinged moth from North America (family NOCTUIDAE). The name is threatened by the earlier synonym *Catocala polygama* Guenée, 1852, which has been applied in the past to other species. The name *C. polygama* has not been used as valid for many years, and since 1938 it has been erroneously treated as a junior synonym of *C. grynea* (Cramer, 1780). It is proposed that the name *C. polygama* be suppressed.

Keywords. Nomenclature; taxonomy; Lepidoptera; NOCTUIDAE; *Catocala*; *Catocala alabamae*; *Catocala grynea*; *Catocala polygama*; moths; North America.

1. In 1852 Guenée described and illustrated (p. 105, pl. 16, fig. 2) a male specimen of a new, small yellow-hindwinged species of *Catocala* Schrank, 1802 as *Catocala polygama*. He gave the provenience of the moth as 'Amérique septentrionale'.

2. In his revision of the Nearctic *Catocala*, Grote (1872, pp. 15–16) noted 'I have before me a number of specimens (Canada to Virginia) which differ in appearance among themselves but which I cannot separate into species, and which I refer to Guenée's *C. polygama*. I think we have to do with a single variable species'. Grote distributed specimens determined by him as *polygama* to many workers and thus the name *polygama* sensu Grote became widely used for one of the common and much collected *Catocala* species occurring in northeastern North America.

3. In 1875 Grote described (p. 427) another small, yellow-hindwinged species from the southern United States as *Catocala alabamae* (type locality Demopolis, Alabama). He compared *alabamae* to the ubiquitous eastern Nearctic species *C. grynea* (Cramer, 1780, index; originally published as *Phalaena grynea*).

4. In the first of two treatises on *Catocala*, Hulst (1880, pp. 6–7) placed Grote's *alabamae* as a variety of *grynea* and treated *polygama* Guenée as valid. In his second treatise, Hulst (1884, pp. 35–39) noted, correctly, that Grote (1872) had misidentified Guenée's species *polygama*. Hulst placed *polygama* Guenée as a synonym of *grynea* Cramer, 1780, and, to resolve Grote's misidentification, proposed the new name *blandula* for the species the latter had called *polygama*. Hulst (1884, p. 36) noted 'The description of *polygama*, Guen., seems to fit this species [*grynea*]; the figure [given by Guenée], which is poor, seems more like var. *alabamae*; neither description nor figure approach the insect identified as *polygama* by Grote'. Under his treatment of *blandula*, Hulst (1884, p. 39) added: 'With regard to *polygama*, Guen., a glance at his figure Noct. 3, pl. 16, f. 2, will convince any one that this species [*blandula*] could not

have been intended. The primaries and secondaries are entirely different. The description accords with *grynea*, and the figure fits it as well as any species known to me'.

5. Smith (1893) followed Hulst in placing both *polygama* Guenée and *alabamiae* as synonyms of *grynea*, and used *blandula* for *polygama* sensu Grote. Dyar (1903) apparently avoided the issue of Grote's misidentification, and listed *polygama* as a full species with *blandula* as its synonym, and treated *alabamiae* as a full species. Hampson (1913) placed *polygama* as a synonym of *grynea*, *blandula* as a synonym of *crataegi* Grote, 1876, and treated *alabamiae* as a full species.

6. In their monograph of the Nearctic *Catocala*, Barnes & McDunnough (1918, p. 40) treated *polygama* Guenée as a synonym of *grynea*, and both *blandula* and *alabamiae* as full species, indicating: 'It should be borne in mind that the '*polygama* Guenée', referred to by Lintner, Saunders, and others of the older authors is not the true species but probably what we have designated as *blandula* Hulst . . . Guenée's figure of *polygama* is very poor but we do not see to what other species [i.e. *grynea*] it can be referred; it is certainly not *blandula*'. In his Nearctic macrolepidopteran checklist, McDunnough (1938) followed Barnes & McDunnough's (1918) treatment of these *Catocala* names.

7. Since McDunnough (1938), the names *blandula* and *alabamiae* have been used exclusively in the Nearctic literature for the respective species. Similarly, *C. polygama* has not been used as a valid name since 1938; it was listed as a synonym of *grynea* in Tietz (1972), Hodges et al. (1983) and Poole (1989), and as a synonym of *alabamiae* in Forbes (1954, p. 335: 'probably *polygama* Guenée'). Unquestionably, Grote's (1872) misidentification of *polygama* Guenée, 1852, Hulst's (1884) placement of both *polygama* Guenée and *alabamiae* as synonyms of *grynea*, and the relative scarcity of specimens for this group of closely related species were all responsible for the unstable position of the name *polygama* in the 19th and early 20th centuries. Dyar's (1903) catalogue was the last major taxonomic work to use the name *polygama* as valid rather than treat it as a synonym. Holland's (1903) *Moth Book*, the most widely available popular book on Nearctic moths in the 20th century, treated *C. polygama* as a full species and pictured a specimen of *C. mira* Grote, 1876 under the name *polygama*. Hence, both Dyar (1903) and Holland (1903) were responsible for continued sporadic erroneous use of *polygama* as the species name for either *blandula* or *mira* (for example, Engel, 1909; Rowley & Berry, 1910; Schroers, 1914; Leonard, 1928). Holland's mistake was well known (see Forbes, 1954, p. 335, for a succinct statement) and not repeated in the taxonomic literature, although the *Moth Book* was not corrected until its 1968 reprinting.

8. Occasionally adults of the group of closely related, small yellow-hindwinged species of *Catocala* can be difficult to determine, but as a result of recent collecting, rearing and life history work it is now firmly established that *alabamiae*, *blandula* and *grynea* are all distinct species. The adults breed true, and the larvae are also readily separable. Although Guenée's original illustration (1852, pl. 16, fig. 2) of *polygama* is clearly not *blandula* Hulst, 1884, a detailed re-examination shows that it is not *grynea* either. The figure is an acceptable, albeit somewhat stylized, rendering of *alabamiae*, as Hulst (1884, p. 36) originally suggested (para. 4 above). Guenée's figure of *polygama* agrees with Grote's (1875) description and type of *alabamiae* (accounting for sexual differences: the *alabamiae* type is a female, whereas Guenée's figure is a

male) in The Natural History Museum, London, as well as with other specimens of *alabamiae* from the Gulf Coast of the southern United States, especially Florida (Gall & Hawks, in press). Thus, since McDunnough (1938), and also for the most part since Barnes & McDunnough (1918), the name *polygama* Guenée, 1852 has been erroneously treated as a junior synonym of *grynea* Cramer, 1780, rather than as a senior synonym of *alabamiae* Grote, 1875. Reintroduction of the name *polygama* in place of *alabamiae* would upset established nomenclatural usage and would cause considerable and unnecessary confusion, and I therefore propose that *polygama* be suppressed. Recent works which demonstrate the usage of the name *alabamiae* include Forbes (1954), Sargent (1976), Covell (1984) and Poole (1989). A representative list of a further seven publications, dating from 1965 to 1999, in which the name has been adopted is held by the Commission Secretariat.

9. The International Commission on Zoological Nomenclature is accordingly asked:

- (1) to use its plenary power to suppress the specific name *polygama* Guenée, 1852, as published in the binomen *Catocala polygama*, for the purposes of the Principle of Priority but not for those of the Principle of Homonymy;
- (2) to place on the Official List of Specific Names in Zoology the name *alabamiae* Grote, 1875, as originally published in the binomen *Catocala alabamiae*;
- (3) to place on the Official Index of Rejected and Invalid Specific Names in Zoology the name *polygama* Guenée, 1852, as published in the binomen *Catocala polygama*, and as suppressed in (1) above.

References

- Barnes, W. & McDunnough, J.H. 1918. Illustrations of the North American species of the genus *Catocala*. *Memoirs of the American Museum of Natural History*, (n.s.) 3: 1–47.
- Covell, C.V. 1984. *A field guide to the moths of eastern North America*. 496 pp. Houghton Mifflin, Boston.
- Cramer, P. 1779. *Die Uitlandsche Kapellen Voorkomende in Drie Waereld-Deelen Asia, Africa en America*, vol. 3. Pp. 1–104, pls. 193–252. Baalde, Amsterdam.
- Dyar, H.G. 1903. *A list of North American Lepidoptera and key to the literature of this Order of insects*. 723 pp. Government Printing Office, Washington.
- Engel, H. 1909. A preliminary list of the Lepidoptera of western Pennsylvania collected in the vicinity of Pittsburgh. *Annals of the Carnegie Museum*, 5: 27–69.
- Forbes, W.T.M. 1954. Lepidoptera of New York and neighboring states. III. Noctuidae. *Memoirs of the Cornell University Agricultural Experiment Station*, 329: 1–433.
- Gall, L.F. & Hawks, D.C. In press. Systematics of moths in the genus *Catocala* (Noctuidae). III. The types of William H. Edwards, Augustus R. Grote, and Achille Guenée. *Journal of the Lepidopterists' Society*, 56.
- Grote, A.R. 1872. On the North American species of *Catocala*. *Transactions of the American Entomological Society*, 4: 1–20.
- Grote, A.R. 1875. On North American Noctuac. *Proceedings of the Academy of Natural Sciences of Philadelphia*, 27: 418–427.
- Grote, A.R. 1876. On species of *Catocala*. *Canadian Entomologist*, 8: 229–232.
- Guenée, A. 1852. *Histoire naturelle des insectes. Species general des lepidoptères*, vol. 7 (Noctuelites, vol. 3). 441 pp. Roret, Paris.
- Hampson, G.F. 1913. *Catalogue of the Lepidoptera Phalaenae in the British Museum*, vol. 12. 626 pp. London.
- Hodges, R.W. 1983. *Check list of the Lepidoptera of America North of Mexico*. 284 pp. University Press, Cambridge.
- Holland, W.J. 1903. *The moth book*. 479 pp. Doubleday, Page, New York.

- Holland, W.J. 1968. *The moth book* (unabridged republication of the 1903 Doubleday edition, with annotations and foreword by A.E. Brower). 479 pp. Dover Publications, New York.
- Hulst, G.D. 1880. Remarks upon the genus *Catocala*, with a catalogue of species and accompanying notes. *Bulletin of the Brooklyn Entomological Society*, 3: 2–13.
- Hulst, G.D. 1884. The genus *Catocala*. *Bulletin of the Brooklyn Entomological Society*, 7: 14–56.
- Leonard, M.D. 1928. A list of the insects of New York. *Cornell University Agricultural Station Memoir*, 101: 1–633.
- McDunnough, J.H. 1938. Check List of the Lepidoptera of Canada and the United States of America. Part 1. Macrolepidoptera. *Memoirs of the Southern California Academy of Sciences*, 1: 1–275.
- Poole, R.W. 1989. Noctuidae. Part 3. *Lepidopterorum Catalogus*, (n.s.)118: 1015–1314.
- Rowley, R & Berry, L. 1910. Notes on the life stages of *Catocala*: a summer's record and incidental mention of other Lepidoptera. *Entomological News*, 21: 441–455.
- Sargent, T.D. 1976. *Legion of night: the underwing moths*. 222 pp. University of Massachusetts Press, Amherst.
- Schroers, P.A. 1914. Preliminary list of Heterocera captured in and around St. Louis, Missouri. *Entomological News*, 25: 59–61.
- Smith, J.B. 1893. A catalogue bibliographical and synonymical of the species of moths of the lepidopterous superfamily Noctuidae found in boreal America. *Bulletin of the United States National Museum*, 44: 1–424.
- Tietz, H.M. 1972. *An index to the described life histories, early stages and hosts of the Macrolepidoptera of the Continental United States and Canada*. 1041 pp. Allyn Museum of Entomology, Sarasota.

Comments on this case are invited for publication (subject to editing) in the *Bulletin*; they should be sent to the Executive Secretary, I.C.Z.N., c/o The Natural History Museum, Cromwell Road, London SW7 5BD, U.K. (e-mail: iczn@nhm.ac.uk).



Nearctic species of *Catocala* moths. a: *C. polygama* Guenée (1852), type, original drawing. b: *C. grynea* (Cramer, 1780). c: *C. alabamiae* Grote (1875), type. d: *C. blandula* Hulst (1884), type.

The Bulletin of Zoological Nomenclature

*[ICZN] The Official Periodical
of the International Commission
on Zoological Nomenclature*

Volume 61, 2004

Published on behalf of the Commission by
The International Trust for Zoological Nomenclature
c/o The Natural History Museum
Cromwell Road
London, SW7 5BD, U.K.

ISSN 0007-5167

© International Trust for Zoological Nomenclature

OPINION 2068 (Case 3210)***Catocala alabamiae* Grote, 1875 (Insecta, Lepidoptera): specific name conserved**

Abstract. The Commission has ruled that the specific name of *Catocala alabamiae* Grote, 1875 for a species of a small, yellow-hindwinged moth from North America (family NOCTUIDAE) is conserved by the suppression of the senior synonym *C. polygama* Guenée, 1852.

Keywords. Nomenclature; taxonomy; Lepidoptera; NOCTUIDAE; *Catocala*; *Catocala alabamiae*; *Catocala polygama*; moths; North America.

Ruling

- (1) Under the plenary power the name *polygama* Guenée, 1852, as published in the binomen *Catocala polygama*, is hereby suppressed for the purposes of the Principle of Priority but not for those of the Principle of Homonymy.
- (2) The name *alabamiae* Grote, 1875, as originally published in the binomen *Catocala alabamiae*, is hereby placed on the Official List of Specific Names in Zoology.
- (3) The name *polygama* Guenée, 1852, as published in the binomen *Catocala polygama* and as suppressed in (1) above, is hereby placed on the Official Index of Rejected and Invalid Specific Names in Zoology.

History of Case 3210

An application to conserve the specific name of *Catocala alabamiae* Grote, 1875, for a species of a small, yellow-hindwinged moth from North America (family NOCTUIDAE), by the suppression of *C. polygama* Guenée, 1852, was received from Lawrence F. Gall (*Peabody Museum of Natural History, Yale University, New Haven, Connecticut, U.S.A.*) on 18 June 2001. After correspondence the case was published in BZN 59: 117–120 (June 2002). The title, abstract and keywords of the case were published on the Commission's website. No comments on this case were received.

Decision of the Commission

On 1 September 2003 the members of the Commission were invited to vote on the proposals published in BZN 59: 119. At the close of the voting period on 1 December 2003 the votes were as follows: 18 Commissioners voted FOR the proposals, 4 Commissioners (Bouchet, Kerzhner, Minelli and Ng) voted AGAINST, no vote was received from Eschmeyer. Böhme and Patterson were on leave of absence.

Voting for the proposals, Calder commented that assigning precedence to the name *C. alabamiae* over *C. polygama* when the two are considered synonyms rather than suppressing the latter name would have been preferable.

Voting against, Bouchet commented that the limited number of references cited in the application does not demonstrate sufficient usage of the name *C. alabamiae* to justify setting aside the Principle of Priority by use of the plenary power. Also voting

against, Ng commented the problem could have been resolved by the careful selection of a neotype for *Catocala polygama* that would keep the name as a junior synonym. Similarly, if there was a problem with the identity of *C. alabamae* because the extant type is a female, a proposal could have been made to the Commission to replace the female with a male specimen that would conserve the name as it is used.

Original references

The following are the original references to the names placed on an Official List and an Official Index by the ruling given in the present Opinion:

- alabamae*, *Catocala*, Grote, 1875, *Proceedings of the Academy of Natural Sciences of Philadelphia*, 27: 427.
- polygama*, *Catocala*, Guenée, 1852, *Histoire naturelle des insectes. Species général des lepidoptères*, vol. 7 (Noctuelites, vol. 3), p. 105.